

Cultural Heritage and Human Rights

An international workshop at the University of Illinois at Urbana-Champaign

Sponsored by

Collaborative for Cultural Heritage and Museum Practices

March 10-11, 2006

The workshop addresses a deeply political aspect of heritage preservation and management: human rights and social justice. Human rights advocates assert that heritage is necessary to the articulation and preservation of cultural identity. The display of heritage monuments and performance can be a strategy for asserting minority identity in the face of majority pressure, and it can be a tool for resistance and the expression of difference. Conversely, the erasure of cultural expressions—such as buildings, monuments, language, religion, and social practices—is a powerful tool in warfare and political regulation. In the assault on human lives and political autonomy, the cultural history and values of a community are also attacked, destroying not only individuals but the very fabric of society.

Is there a universal right to the free expression and preservation of cultural heritage, and if so, where is that right articulated and can it be protected? Is cultural heritage a concept that serves to enforce group conformity or can it be a way to maintain and display difference? How is the notion of “heritage” used variously to unite and divide communities? Who defines cultural heritage and who should control stewardship and the benefits of cultural heritage? What is the impact on human lives and social groups of heritage preservation policies and designations? Are international heritage trusts or grassroots organizations more successful at promoting local welfare?

Keynote Address

4:00 p.m. Friday, March 10

Plym Auditorium, Temple Hoyne Buell

William Logan (Deakin University, Melbourne, Australia)

Closing Pandora's Box: Human Rights Conundrums in Cultural Heritage Protection

Workshop

8:30 a.m.-6 p.m., Saturday, March 11

IPRH Building, 805 W. Pennsylvania Avenue, Urbana

8:30 Coffee

8:45 Helaine Silverman and D. Fairchild Ruggles
Welcoming Remarks and Introduction

9:00 Hugo Benavides (Fordham University)
Historical Disruptions: Reproducing an Indian Past in Latin America

9:45 Larry Zimmerman (Indiana University-Purdue University at Indianapolis)
Indigenous People and Resistance to Public Heritage Commemoration of Their Pasts

10:30 Jan French (Duke University)
Buried Alive: Imagining Africa in the Brazilian Northeast

BREAK

11:30 Charles Orser (Illinois State University)
Transnational Diasporas and Heritage: Who Has Rights to What, Where?

12:15 Anne Pyburn (Indiana University)
Wagging the Dog: Archaeology as a Positive Political Force in Kyrgyzstan, Central Asia

1-2 pm LUNCH BREAK

2:00 Laurajane Smith (University of York, England)
Intersections of Archaeological Management Practice on Areas of Public Policy and the Cultural Politics of Identity

2:45 Elazar Barkan (Claremont Graduate University)
Burkas and Genes: Predicaments of Human Rights and Cultural Property

3:30 Chris Silver (UIUC)
Cultural Heritage and Human Rights in Indonesia: The Challenges of an Emerging Democratic Society

4:15 James Wescoat (UIUC)
The Indo-Islamic Garden: Conflict, Conservation and Conciliation in Gujarat, India

5:00 BREAK

5:15 William Logan (Deakin University, Australia)
ROUNDTABLE DISCUSSION: Key Issues and Case Studies in Cultural Heritage and Human Rights

6:00 Karan Grover (Baroda Heritage Trust, India)
Presentation and Exhibition of the Baroda Heritage Trust's work in Champaner-Pavagadh (India) – workshop moves to the atrium of Temple Hoyne Buell

6:30 DINNER RECEPTION in the atrium of Temple Hoyne Buell

CHAMP thanks its collaborators: Illinois Program for Research in the Humanities, Human Dimensions of Environmental Systems, Center for Global Studies, Department of Anthropology, Department of Landscape Architecture, and the Baroda Heritage Trust

SPEAKER BIOS

Elazar Barkan is Professor of History and Cultural Studies at Claremont Graduate University in Los Angeles. He is also the director of the Institute for Historical Justice and Reconciliation (<http://www.salzburgseminar.org/ihjr>), an independent, nonprofit institution. He specializes in modern European intellectual and cultural history, cultural property, imperialism, colonialism and post colonialism, history of anthropology, race and racism, and primitivism and modernism. He is interested in the evolving new-world system as it confronts the morals of the global with the local. He examines the ways in which enlightenment principles of individual human rights come into collision with traditions and group rights. Of particular concern to him is the predicament evolving from the collision of identity and morality as manifested in competing local spaces. His research explores the role of history in contemporary society and politics, and the way the conflict of tradition and modernity unfolds around the debate over groups and individual rights and international justice, including “victimization as an identity,” the use of relative victimization as a form of political power, and, with particular emphasis on the response to gross historical crimes and injustices and human rights. Professor Barkan recently co-edited (with Ronald Bush) *Claiming the Stones, Naming the Bones: Cultural Property and the Negotiation of National and Ethnic Identity*, published by the Getty Research Institute (2003). He is also the author of *The Guilt of Nations: Restitution and Negotiating Historical Injustices* (2000), based on the 1998 conference he organized at Oxford University and a recent international conference in Claremont. He is the author of *Retreat of Scientific Racism*, and the co-editor (with Marie-Denise Shelton) of *Borders, Exiles, and Diaspora*. He edited (with Ronald Bush) *Prehistories of the Future: Primitivism, Modernism and Politics*. *Taking Wrongs Seriously: Apologies and Reconciliation* (an edited volume with Alexander Karn) is forthcoming.

O. Hugo Benavides is an Assistant Professor of Anthropology, Latin American and Latino Studies, and International Political Economy and Development at Fordham University. He was born in Guayaquil, Ecuador but has lived over half of his life in New York City. His books *Making Ecuadorian Histories: Four Centuries of Defining Power* (2004) and *The Politics of Sentiment: Imagining and Remembering Guayaquil* (2006) are published by University of Texas Press. His articles have appeared in *Latin American Antiquity* (“Anthropology’s Native Conundrum: Uneven Histories and Development” 24/2: 159-178 [2004]), *Journal of Latin American Anthropology* (“The Representation of Guayaquil’s Sexual Past: Historicizing the Enchaquirados,” 7/1:68-103 [2002]), *Social Text* (“Seeing Xica and the Melodramatic Unveiling of Colonial Desire,” 21/3: 109-134 [2003]) and *Critique of Anthropology* (“Returning to the Source: Social Archaeology as Latin American Philosophy,” 12/4:355-370 [2001]) as well as several Latin American journals.

Jan Hoffman French (Ph.D., Cultural Anthropology, Duke University, 2003; J.D. University of Connecticut Law School, 1981) has just been hired as an assistant professor in the Department of Anthropology at the University of Richmond in Virginia. She recently completed a visiting fellowship at Kellogg Institute for International Studies at the University of Notre Dame. She has also held a Rockefeller Foundation fellowship at Northwestern University and a postdoctoral fellowship at Center for Latin American

Studies of University of Maryland, College Park. A former practicing attorney in Brazil and the United States, French's articles have appeared in the *American Ethnologist*, *American Anthropologist*, and *Political and Legal Anthropology Review*. She is currently completing a book manuscript, "The Rewards of Resistance: Legalizing Black and Indian Identities in Northeast Brazil."

William (Bill) Logan holds the UNESCO Chair of Heritage and Urbanism in the School of Social and International Studies at Deakin University in Australia. He has been involved in cultural heritage conservation since the early 1970s. Since 1986 he has been an International Expert for the UNESCO Division of Cultural Heritage in Paris, where his work has mainly been related to UNESCO's international campaigns to safeguard world cultural heritage sites in Pakistan, Sri Lanka, Bangladesh, Nepal, and Vietnam. He has also acted for the UNESCO World Heritage Centre at international meetings of experts in Vietnam, Indonesia and Korea and has contributed to its 'State of the World Heritage' Report (2005). He is a member of Australia ICOMOS, the national committee of ICOMOS (International Council on Monuments and Sites), based in Paris, and was the national president from 1999 to 2002. He has represented ICOMOS at international meetings in Japan and Korea. He has been a consultant to AusAID, the Australian Heritage Commission and Department of the Environment and Heritage, and the Victorian Department of Infrastructure, and he is a member of AusHeritage (including Board Member, 1998-89). This involvement with international and national heritage bodies has directly led to course innovations and research activities at Deakin University. Professor Logan introduced two courses in Vietnamese history and culture and instigated the development of an Asian Studies major. He led the establishment of the Cultural Heritage postgraduate program at Deakin in 2000. He is Director of Cultural Heritage Center for Asia and the Pacific, a research and training center that has UNESCO endorsement. His research record includes numerous Australian Research Council and other grants, and two recent books on heritage in the Asian region (notably *Hanoi: Biography of a City*, which won the International Planning History Society Book Prize in 2002; and *The Disappearing "Asian" City: Protecting Asia's Urban Heritage in a Globalizing World*, published by Oxford University Press in 2002). He also is the author of numerous articles in refereed and professional journals, and conference papers. He was awarded the Deakin University Researcher of the Year Award in 2002 and was made an Alfred Deakin Professorship in 2004. In addition to establishing heritage programs in several universities in Victoria, he helped develop postgraduate heritage courses at Silpakorn University in Bangkok and the University of Santo Tomas in Manila. He is also a member of the International Advisory Board of the Academy of Irish Cultural Heritages, University of Ulster, UK, and the editorial board of *Spatial Habitus*, a series of monographs published by the University of Hawai'i Press and the China Institute in America, New York. Currently he is engaged in the following research projects:

- (1) 'UNESCO as an Agency of Cultural Globalisation?' (ARC Discovery Grant, 2002-2005; team leader, with M. Askew, M. Langfield, C. Long, A. Smith, J. Sweet)
- (2) 'Heritage Site Management in Australia and China: A Cross-Cultural Study of Site Identification, Management and Interpretation' (ARC Linkage Grant 2002-4, with K. Altenburg, S. Sullivan, J. Sweet)
- (3) 'Urban Activism in Melbourne in the 1950s and 1960s (ARC Discovery grant, 2003-

- 4, with G. Davison, R. Howe)
- (4) 'Imperial Hue: Townscape Transformation of Vietnam's Nguyen Dynasty Capital, 1802-2002' (with C. Long)
 - (5) 'Cultural Heritage and Urban History of Vientiane, Laos (with M. Askew, C. Long)
 - (6) 'Places of Pain and Shame: The Heritage of Imprisonment Sites (Deakin University Central Research Grant, 2003)
 - (7) 'University Planning and Design: The Vietnamese Experience' (with Prof Nguyen Hong Thuc, Hanoi Architectural University)
 - (8) 'Dien Bien Phu, Vietnam: significance and management'

Charles E. Orser, Jr. is Distinguished Professor of Anthropology at Illinois State University. A historical archaeologist, he uses anthropologically informed archaeology to investigate the lives of men and women ignored by official, written history and their interactions with people of power. His books include *The Material Basis of the Postbellum Tenant Plantation*, *A Historical Archaeology of the Modern World*, *Historical Archaeology*, and *Race and Practice in Archaeological Interpretation*. He is also the founding editor of the *International Journal of Historical Archaeology* and the editor of the *Encyclopedia of Historical Archaeology*.

K. Anne Pyburn is Professor of Anthropology & Gender Studies at Indiana University (<http://www.indiana.edu/~anthro/people/pyburn.html>) and the Director of the Center for Archaeology in the Public Interest (CAPI) (<http://www.research.indiana.edu/centers/capi.html>). Her primary research has been conducted in Belize, where she integrates concerns with ethics, gender, early cities, and the ancient Maya. At the site of Chau Hiix she is investigating an ancient Maya town and she convenes a field school on alternate years at the invitation of the government of Belize and the residents of Crooked Tree Village (<http://www.indiana.edu/~overseas/flyers/chauhiix.html>). She similarly applies principles of ethically and socially engaged archaeology in the Koch Kor Valley of Kyrgyzstan where she is directing a project designed to nurture the development of community museums (<http://www.indiana.edu/~capi/>). She is the co-editor of *Archaeologies: The Journal of the World Archaeological Congress* (<http://www.altamirapress.com/RLA/journals/Archaeologies/index.shtml>) and Director of the "Making Archaeology Teaching Relevant in the XXI Century Project" (MATRIX) (<http://www.indiana.edu/~arch/saa/matrix/>) of the Society for American Archaeology.

Chris Silver is Head of the Department of Urban and Regional Planning at the University of Illinois. His planning interests converge from three distinct but related areas, including urban and planning history, international planning, and housing and community development. Planning history has been the central focus of his published research, including three books, *Twentieth Century Richmond: Planning, Politics and Race* (1984), *The Separate City: Black Communities in the Urban South, 1940-1968*, with John Moeser (1995), and *Planning the Twentieth Century American City*, with Mary Corbin Sies (1996). He is currently completing a history of planning in the urban South from the 1890s through the 1950s. Beginning with a Fulbright Senior Lectureship in 1989-90, he has been teaching, researching and consulting on international planning, with

a focus on urban development and decentralization in Indonesia, over the past decade. This includes three years (1995-1997) as an Urban Development Advisor to Indonesia under a U.S. Agency for International Development project based in Jakarta. A new book project links this international work with planning history through an examination of the emergence of Jakarta as a megacity in the twentieth century. The focus of Dr. Silver's teaching, consulting and research is housing and community development, including the role of historic preservation in urban revitalization. Through collaboration with several Indonesian universities, that work has been broadened to incorporate democratization, social capital formation, and community-based planning. Current research involves a critical assessment of the current decentralization and democracy movements in Indonesian cities.

Laurajane Smith is co-director of studies in the Masters in Archaeological Heritage Management at the University of York, England. Her research interests include the politics of heritage management, the intersection of archaeological and management practices on areas of public policy and the cultural politics of identity, community involvement in heritage management and research, heritage tourism, archaeological ethics, archaeological theory in general and feminist archaeology in particular. Prior to her arrival in York she taught both Indigenous Studies and Cultural Heritage Management at the University of New South Wales, Sydney, Australia. She also directed her own cultural heritage consultantancy business for a number of years in south-eastern Australia. She recently published *Archaeological Theory and the Politics of Cultural Heritage* (Routledge, 2004).

James L. Wescoat, Jr. is Professor and Head of the Department of Landscape Architecture at the University of Illinois at Urbana-Champaign. He earned a Bachelor of Landscape Architecture degree from Louisiana State University and Masters and PhD degrees in Geography from the University of Chicago. His research has concentrated on water systems in the US and South Asia from the site to river basin scales. At the larger scale, he has written about water policy issues in the Colorado, Indus, Ganges, Aral Sea, and Great Lakes basins, including the history of multilateral conflicts and water treaties. He led an NSF-funded project on "Water and Poverty in Colorado," and a USEPA-funded study of climate change in the Indus basin, that included a paper on "The Right of Thirst for Animals in Islamic Water Law." In 2003, he published *Water for Life: Water Management and Environmental Policy* with geographer Gilbert F. White (Cambridge University Press). For the greater part of his career, however, Professor Wescoat has focused on the small-scale historic waterworks of Mughal gardens in India and Pakistan. He led the Smithsonian Institution's project titled, "Garden, City, and Empire: The Historical Geography of Mughal Lahore," which resulted in the publication of *Mughal Gardens: Sources, Places, Representations, Prospects* (1996), *The Mughal Garden: Interpretation, Conservation, and Implications* (1996), and numerous articles. More recently, he has contributed to a cultural landscape heritage conservation project at the Champaner-Pavagadh World Heritage Site in Gujarat, India, with Architect Karan Grover of the Baroda Heritage Trust; Professors Sinha, Ruggles, Kesler; and teams of students in landscape architecture at the University of Illinois at Urbana-Champaign.

Larry Zimmerman is Professor of Anthropology & Museum Studies and Public Scholar of Native American Representation at Indiana University-Purdue University Indianapolis and the Eiteljorg Museum. He earned his PhD in Anthropology at the University of Kansas-Lawrence. He taught at the University of South Dakota, leaving in 1996 as Distinguished Regents Professor, served as Visiting Professor of Anthropology and Chair of American Indian and Native Studies at the University of Iowa, and as Head of the Archaeology Department at the Minnesota Historical Society. He is Vice President of the World Archaeological Congress, has held a number of offices and editorships for professional organizations, and has been a National Lecturer for Sigma Xi, the Scientific Research Society. He has published more than 200 articles and book chapters and has authored, edited, or co-edited 19 books including *Native North America*, *Presenting the Past*, and *Ethical Issues in Archaeology*. His scholarly interests are in Great Plains archaeology, cultural and intellectual property issues, and relationships between American Indians and archaeologists. He recently began a major research project on the archaeology of homelessness.